

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

REGION 4 ATLANTA FEDERAL CENTER 61 FORSYTH STREET ATLANTA, GEORGIA 30303-8960

SEP 0 5 2012

CERTIFIED MAIL RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

Carl J. Fabry President Plant Food Systems, Inc. 2827 Union Street Zellwood, Florida 32798

> Re: Plant Food Systems, Inc. Ratified Consent Agreement and Final Order Docket No. FIFRA-04-2012-3011(b)

Dear Mr. Fabry:

Enclosed is a copy of the ratified Consent Agreement and Final Order (CAFO) in the above-referenced matter. The original CAFO has been filed with the Regional Hearing Clerk and served on the parties as directed in Section 22.6 of the Consolidated Rules of Practice, 40 C.F.R. Part 22.

Please refer to Section V of the CAFO for penalty information and payment requirements. To ensure proper processing, the respondent name and docket number for this case, identified above and in the CAFO, should be noted on any cashier's or certified check submitted in payment of the penalty.

Also enclosed is a copy of a document entitled "Notice of Securities and Exchange Commission Registrants' Duty to Disclose Environmental Legal Proceedings." This document puts you on notice of your potential duty to disclose to the Securities and Exchange Commission any environmental enforcement actions taken by the EPA. Where used in the document "SEC" refers to the Securities and Exchange Commission.

Should you have any questions about this matter or your compliance status in the future, please contact Ms. Patricia Livingston of the EPA Region 4 staff at (404) 562-9171.

Sincerely,

Jareani

Jeaneanne M. Gettle Chief Pesticides and Toxic Substances Branch

Enclosures

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY REGION 4 ATLANTA, GEORGIA

In the Matter of:

Plant Food Systems, Inc.

Docket No.: FIFRA-04-2012-3011(b)

2012 SEP -5 AM 8: 22 HEARING CLERK

Respondent.

CONSENT AGREEMENT AND FINAL ORDER

I. Nature of the Action

- This is a civil penalty proceeding pursuant to Section 14(a) of the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act, as amended, 7 U.S.C. § 136*l*(a) (FIFRA), and pursuant to the Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties and the Revocation/Termination or Suspension of Permits (Consolidated Rules), 40 C.F.R. Part 22. Complainant is the Director of the Air, Pesticides and Toxics Management Division, United States Environmental Protection Agency, Region 4. Respondent is Plant Food Systems, Inc.
- 2. The authority to take action under Section 14(a) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136*l*(a), is vested in the Administrator of EPA. The Administrator of EPA has delegated this authority under FIFRA to EPA Region 4 by EPA Delegation 5-14, dated May 11, 1994. The Regional Administrator, Region 4, has redelegated this authority to the Director, Air, Pesticides and Toxics Management Division, by EPA Region 4 Delegation 5-14, dated September 7, 2005. Pursuant to that delegation, the Director of the Air, Pesticides and Toxics Management Division has the authority to commence an enforcement action as

the Complainant in this matter, and has the authority to sign consent agreements memorializing settlements between EPA and Respondent.

3. Complainant and Respondent have conferred for the purpose of settlement pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 22.18 and desire to resolve this matter and settle the allegations described herein without a formal hearing. Therefore, without the taking of any evidence or testimony, the making of any argument, or the adjudication of any issue in this matter, and in accordance with 40 C.F.R. § 22.13(b), this Consent Agreement and Final Order (CAFO) will simultaneously commence and conclude this matter.

II. Preliminary Statements

4. Pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 22.5(c)(4) the following individual is authorized to receive service for EPA in this proceeding:

Patricia Livingston Pesticides Section U.S. EPA - Region 4 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960 (404) 562-9171.

- Respondent is a Florida corporation, located at 2827 Union Street, Zellwood, Florida 32798 (Facility).
- 6. Respondent is a "person" as defined by Section 2(s) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(s), and as such is subject to FIFRA and the regulations promulgated thereunder.

III. Specific Allegations

- On or about November 16, 2009, an authorized representative of the EPA conducted an inspection at the Respondent's Facility.
- At the time of the inspection, the Respondent provided the inspector with an Invoice,
 Delivery Ticket, Bill of Lading and Purchase Order for each of four shipments which

Plant Food Systems, Inc. FIFRA-04-2012-3011(b) confirmed that the Respondent had sold and/or distributed the product, SilPhite, on at least four occasions.

- 9. The label on the SilPhite product bore the claim that "Disease pressure is thereby reduced, increasing cell wall turgidity and thickness, thru systematically acquired resistance (SAR) and induced resistance (IR)." The statement on the label concerning disease resistance imparted to a plant is considered a pesticidal claim.
- 10. The Respondent's product, SilPhite, is a pesticide as defined in Section 2(u) of FIFRA,
 7 U.S.C. § 136(u), which includes any substance or mixture of substances intended for preventing, destroying, repelling, or mitigating any pest, because it bore a label containing the pesticidal claims above-referenced in paragraph 9.
- 11. A pest is defined in Section 2(t) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(t), as any insect, rodent, nematode, fungus, weed, or any other form of terrestrial or aquatic plant or animal life or virus, bacteria, or other micro-organism (except viruses, bacteria, or other microorganisms on or in living man or other living animals) which the Administrator declares to be a pest under Section 25(c)(1) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136w(c)(1).
- 12. Respondent "distributes or sells" pesticides. The term "to distribute or sell" as defined by Section 2(gg) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(gg), includes to distribute, sell, offer for sale, hold for distribution, hold for sale, hold for shipment, ship, deliver for shipment, or release for shipment.
- 13. Pesticides that are sold and distributed in the United States are required to be registered with the EPA, pursuant to Section 3 of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136a.
- 14. At the time of the inspection, SilPhite was not registered as a pesticide with EPA.

- Under Section 12(a)(1)(A) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(A), it is unlawful for any person to distribute or sell to any person any pesticide that is not registered under Section 3 of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136a.
- 16. Respondent violated Section 12(a)(1)(A) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(A), and is therefore subject to the assessment of civil penalties under Section 14 of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136*l*.
- 17. Section 14(a) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136*l*(a), in conjunction with the Debt CollectionImprovement Act of 1996, authorizes the assessment of a civil penalty.
- 18. Section 14(a)(4) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a)(4), requires EPA to consider the appropriateness of the assessed penalty to the size of business of the Respondent, the effect on Respondent's ability to continue in business, and the gravity of the violation.
- 23. After consideration of the factors set forth in Section 14(a)(4) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C.
 § 136l(a)(4), the EPA proposes to assess a total civil penalty of NINE THOUSAND
 DOLLARS (\$9,000) against the Respondent for the above-described violations. Civil penalties under Section 14(a) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a), may be assessed by Administrative Order.

IV. Consent Agreement

- 24. For the purposes of this CAFO, Respondent admits the jurisdictional allegations set forth above and neither admits nor denies the factual allegations set forth above.
- 25. Respondent waives its right to a hearing on the allegations contained herein and its right to appeal the proposed Final Order accompanying the Consent Agreement.
- 26. Respondent consents to the assessment of the penalty proposed by EPA and agrees to pay the civil penalty as set forth in this CAFO.

- 27. Respondent certifies that as of the date of its execution of this CAFO, it is in compliance with all relevant requirements of FIFRA.
- 28. Compliance with this CAFO shall resolve the allegations of the violations contained herein. This CAFO shall not otherwise affect any liability of Respondent to the United States. Other than as expressed herein, neither the EPA nor Complainant waives any right to bring an enforcement action against Respondent for violation of any federal or state statute, regulation or permit, to initiate an action for imminent and substantial endangerment, or to pursue criminal enforcement.
- 29. Complainant and Respondent agree to settle this matter by their execution of this CAFO The parties agree that the settlement of this matter is in the public interest and that this CAFO is consistent with the applicable requirements of FIFRA.

V. Final Order

- 30. Respondent is assessed a civil penalty of **NINE THOUSAND DOLLARS (\$9,000)** which shall be paid within 30 days from the effective date of this CAFO.
- 31. Respondent shall remit the penalty by either a cashier's or certified check made payable to the "Treasurer, United States of America," and shall send the check via U.S. mail to the following address:

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Fines and Penalties Cincinnati Finance Center P.O. Box 979077 St. Louis, Missouri 63197-9000.

The check shall reference on its face the name of the Respondent and Docket Number of this CAFO.

32. At the time of payment, Respondent shall send a separate copy of the check and a written statement that the payment is being made in accordance with this CAFO, to the following persons at the following addresses:

Regional Hearing Clerk U.S. EPA - Region 4 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960;

Patricia Livingston Pesticides Section U.S. EPA - Region 4 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960; and

Saundi J. Wilson Office of Environmental Accountability U.S. EPA - Region 4 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960.

- 33. For the purposes of state and federal income taxation, Respondent shall not be entitled, and agrees not to attempt, to claim a deduction for any civil penalty payment made pursuant to this CAFO. Any attempt by Respondent to deduct any such payments shall constitute a violation of this CAFO.
- 34. Pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3717, EPA is entitled to assess interest and penalties on debts owed to the United States and a charge to cover the cost of processing and handling a delinquent claim. Interest will therefore begin to accrue on the civil penalty from the effective date of this CAFO, if the penalty is not paid by the date required. A charge will also be assessed to cover the administrative costs, both direct and indirect, of overdue debts. In addition, a late payment penalty charge shall be applied on any principal amount not paid within 90 days of the due date.

- 35. Complainant and Respondent shall bear their own costs and attorney fees in this matter.
- 36. This CAFO shall be binding upon the Respondent, its successors and assigns. Each undersigned representative of the parties to this CAFO certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the party represented to enter into this CAFO and hereby legally binds that party to it.

The remainder of this page was intentionally left blank

VI. Effective Date

37. The effective date of this CAFO shall be the date on which the CAFO is filed with the

Regional Hearing Clerk.

AGREED AND CONSENTED TO:

Respondent: Plant Food Systems, Inc. Docket No.: FIFRA-04-2012-3011(b)

(Signature) Date: 8-29-12 By: tabi ่นง (Typed or Printed) Name: Title: (Typed or Printed)

Complainant:

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

By: 4 Beverly H. Banister, Director

Air, Pesticides and Toxics Management Division

Date:

🧹 ____ day of _**∽_** APPROVED AND SO ORDERED this _____ 2012

S. Schus

Susan B. Schub Regional Judicial Officer

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on the date set out below, I filed the original and one copy of the foregoing Consent Agreement and Final Order and served a true and correct copy of the foregoing Consent Agreement and Final Order In the Matter Plant Food Systems, Inc., Docket Number: FIFRA-04-2012-3011(b), to the addressees listed below:

Mr. Carl J. Fabry President Plant Food Systems, Inc. 2827 Union Street Zellwood, Florida 32798

Patricia Livingston Pesticides Section U.S. EPA Region 4 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, Georgia 30303

Robert Caplan Associate Regional Counsel Office of Environmental Accountability U.S. EPA Region 4 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, Georgia 30303

Date: 9-5-12

(via Certified Mail, Return Receipt Requested)

(via EPA's internal mail)

(via EPA's internal mail)

Patricia A. Bullock, Regional Hearing Clerk U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 4 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, Georgia 30303 (404) 562-9511